060 & 062
Law & Commerce Complex
1. Statement of Significance

The Law and Commerce Buildings were designed and constructed as part of a single project between 1965 and 1967. Their architect was John Holliday-Scott of the Saskatoon firm Holliday-Scott & Associates. Holliday-Scott was one of the most accomplished architects of his generation working in Saskatchewan, and the Law Building, in particular, is one of his best works. In this and other projects such as the Dentistry Building and the Lutheran Seminary, Holliday-Scott took the traditional architecture of the University of Saskatchewan and translated it into a contemporary architectural language of his own invention. The Law Building has heritage significance as perhaps the best example of the work of this exceptional architect, and as one of the best examples of Modern architecture at the University of Saskatchewan.
Both the Law and the Commerce wings of the building have received recent additions. An addition to the north side of the original Commerce Building was designed by Kindrachuk Agrey Architects and completed in 2002. An addition to the south of the Law Building was designed by Stantec Architecture and was completed in 2007. These additions are beyond the scope of this report.

Note: the Commerce Building was renamed the ‘Edwards School of Business’ in 2007. For clarity, it is referred to as the ‘Commerce Building’ throughout this report. The Law and Commerce Buildings are configured with floors numbered basement, ground floor, first floor, second floor. This report follows the same convention.
2. Character - Defining Elements

2.1 Materials

The exterior of the Law and Commerce complex combines materials traditional to the University of Saskatchewan with Modern materials. The dominant exterior materials are ‘greystone’ and Tyndall stone, traditional materials that characterize much of the architecture of the University of Saskatchewan campus (Figures 2 & 3).* However, while greystone was used on earlier buildings as the principal material for walls, and cut Tyndall stone was used for trim and decoration, here the use of these materials is less constrained. Smooth cut Tyndall stone forms the primary exterior cladding of the Commerce Building, accented by dark purple glazed ceramic tile and grey porcelain enameled panels (Figure 3). On the Law Building, materials are used to differentiate the compositional elements of the building (Figure 4). Rough-faced, uncoursed greystone is used to create a low planter wall that encircles the building. The stone is laid such that the mortar is set back from the surface, to resemble a mortarless ‘dry-stone’ wall. Rough-faced, randomly coursed greystone is used to define a base on the ground and first floors. Cut Tyndall stone is used to create a middle section on the second floor. Slender precast concrete elements are used to define a roof-top cupola. The proportion of glazing to stone increases at each level: narrow slot windows on the ground & first floors, larger openings on the second floor, and full glazing interrupted only by narrow concrete spires on the cupola. Full aluminum-framed curtainwall glazing is also used to create transparent links between the Law Building, the Commerce classroom wing and the Commerce faculty wing (Figure 5). Greystone, Tyndall stone, precast concrete, ceramic tile and aluminum-framed glazing are all character-defining materials.

Exterior materials are often extended to the interior: at the glazed link joining the Law and Commerce buildings, Tyndall stone and greystone are both extended from the exterior to the interior, separated only by a sheet of glass (Figure 6). The glazed entrance lobby and the link between Commerce and the Arts Complex are also differentiated from other areas of the building by the use of Welsh quarry tile as a flooring material. The tile flooring of the links and the interior application of exterior materials are character-defining elements.

*For further information on building stones used at the U of S, refer to ‘Appendix: Stone’.

---

Figure 4. North facade.

Figure 5. Glazing.

Figure 6. Tyndall stone on the exterior and interior separated by glazing.

Figure 7. Terrazzo and Welsh quarry tile.
Staircases throughout both buildings have terrazzo treads and landings with steel balustrades (Figures 7 & 8). Exit stairs have wooden handrails. The central stair in the entrance lobby is a beautiful feature of the building. It is designed such that its steel handrails form its structure, and its stainless steel and terrazzo treads are suspended by tension rods that form its balusters. In this way the whole element is made lighter, such that it appears to float in the light-filled space of the glazed lobby. The stair in the entrance lobby is a character-defining element.

Aluminum, marble wall tile and dark stained oak are found throughout the interior of the Law Building. Oak paneling with aluminum trim is used in the ‘Moot Court’ room. An oak jury box, witness stand, judges’ bench and rolling chalkboard and frame are also found in this room (Figure 9). (See Section 3 Associated Objects). Oak is also used extensively in the Law Library in the shelving, study carrels, tables and other millwork. Oak is also generally used for doors and transoms, and wall paneling. Columns in the Law Building are faced with natural anodized aluminum and brown marble tile, and have oak baseboards (Figure 12). Other columns were clad in white vinyl. The balustrade on the second floor corridor overlooking the library is a low wall made of striated, painted concrete. This balustrade, shown in Figure 13, is topped with a steel and oak hand rail. Painted concrete, dark stained oak, marble and aluminum are character-defining materials of the Law Building.

The interior materials of the Commerce Building are generally less opulent. The corridors are faced in painted concrete block. Structural columns in the Commerce Wing are painted concrete. Wooden elements such as doors and transoms are differentiated by the use of birch rather than oak. However, in select locations, such as the walls on each floor separating the Commerce Building from the Arts Building, marble tile is used as a finish material. Holliday-Scott often used accent colours in his architecture. In the case of the Law and Commerce Complex the architect specified custom made carpets that have since been removed. Red carpet was used in the Commerce Building and blue in the Law Building.
2.2 Form & Style

The Law and Commerce complex is an excellent work of late Modern architecture. The Law Building, in particular, is a masterful building in which the principles of Modernism are employed not as rigid precepts, but as parts of a broader framework of possible references, selected and manipulated for their expressive potential. In this way, the traditions of the university and of the legal profession were given a clear and contemporary form.

A material, spatial and stylistic difference is discernible when comparing the Law and Commerce Buildings. In an interview carried out for this report, Holliday-Scott attributed this departure to the philosophical differences between the two schools, and the tendency of commerce to be more practical, compared to law, which places a greater emphasis on ideas. The architect reflected these attributes by giving the exterior of the Commerce Building a more regular form and the Law Building one of greater complexity. The functional program for the Law Building also offered opportunity for more complexity. At the time, Dean of Law Otto Lang described the Law Building as a
structural expression of the majesty of law.

Although it functions as two buildings, the Law and Commerce complex is arranged formally as a series of three functional components, linked and separated by glazed connectors. These three components are the Law Building, the Commerce classroom wing and the Commerce faculty wing. They are each three-storeys in height, in addition to a basement level in the Law Building. The three wings are arranged in a linear fashion, roughly west to east. The Law Building and the Commerce classroom wing are connected by a glazed entrance lobby and central stair. The two parts of the Commerce Building were originally connected by a glazed link containing a student lounge on each of its three floors, but this part of the building was substantially altered by the 2002 addition. The Commerce Building defers in some respects to the design of the classroom wing of the Arts complex, to which it is adjoined, matching its datum lines and principle materials.

Modernist architecture in its early and most orthodox period was characterized by a simplification of forms, by a rejection of applied ornament and by an emphasis on the expression of function and structure. By the late period of Modernism, in the 1960’s, this orthodoxy had begun to yield to a more expressive impulse in the work of architects such as Eero Saarinen, Alvar Aalto and Oscar Niemeyer. Also by the late 1960’s and 1970’s, architects and theorists such as Louis Kahn and Robert Venturi were beginning to reintroduce the potential of historical architectural forms and references. Venturi’s influential manifesto, *Complexity and Contradiction in Architecture*, was published in 1966. By this point, the Law-Commerce complex was already well under construction, but here and in his other work at the University of Saskatchewan, John Holliday-Scott anticipated the re-introduction of history advocated by Venturi. The results are arguably more subtle and successful than most of the work of the later Post-Modern period, when this approach reached its zenith.
In his combination of traditional and Modern materials and in his inventive reinterpretation of traditional forms, Holliday-Scott gave a delightful contemporary expression to the traditions of the College of Law and the university. Holliday-Scott tapped into a broad stream of cultural references, not restricting himself to the particular language of Collegiate Gothic precedent favoured by his predecessors at the University of Saskatchewan, or by the prevailing styles of his own time. The tripartite arrangement of the Law Building, with a heavy rusticated base, a more refined midsection and a lighter filigreed cap was a device borrowed from the Classical architecture of the Renaissance. On the west side of the Law Building, the heavy stone walls at the base of the building are composed with a series of narrow windows to resemble the battlements of a mediaeval castle (Figures 17 & 18). The cupola, with its slender screen of spires, recalls the Chemistry (Thorvaldson) Building of Brown & Vallance and its own earlier precedents (Figure 19). Although clear in their inference, all of these forms are rendered in a modern way.
Other aspects of the building are unequivocally modern. The use of glazing to define connective spaces separating discreet functions is a common device of Modernist architecture, and similar to the approach taken in the Arts complex. Holliday-Scott’s expression of materials is also typically modern. Often material surfaces are used to define a form or volume, such as the faculty lounge and reading rooms on the second floor, which are rendered as discrete oak boxes projecting into the space of the library. This expression is supported by beautiful detailing; the oak doors leading into these rooms are built with narrow oak frames such that their material surface is uninterrupted (Figure 20).

The use of exposed structural elements is another hallmark of Modernist architecture employed to full expressive effect in the Law and Commerce Buildings. The concrete waffle slabs forming the floor structures of the building are exposed as finished ceilings in the entrance lobby and in the library (Figures 21 & 22). In the lobby, also, steel columns are left exposed. The stair in the entrance lobby, with its open treads suspended from above by steel tension rods, recalls a classic Modernist precedent: Eero Saarinen’s suspended stair in the General Motors Technical Center in Detroit (1949-55) (Figure 23). The complex spatial configuration of the Law Building, with the library as its central focus, evokes the interconnected spaces of Paul Rudolph’s Yale School of Architecture (1959-63) (Figure 25 & 26).
Figure 25. A perspectival section through the Yale School of Architecture by Paul Rudolph. Retrieved from http://places.designobserver.com/feature/reading-rudolph/12607/

Figure 26. A perspectival section through the Law Library. Retrieved from Facilities Management Division Asset Record System, File LC-49-P.
2.4 Location

The Law and Commerce Buildings are located on the main campus of the University of Saskatchewan. They are oriented roughly east-west, with their main entrance facing north towards Campus Drive, and are connected to the Arts Complex to the south. The angle of their orientation derives from that of the Arts Complex, and the Thorvaldson Building. The location of the original portions of the complex is indicated in green on the contemporary campus plan shown in Figure 27.

2.5 Spatial Configuration

The Law and Commerce complex is arranged in plan as a series of three components: the Law Building, the Commerce classroom wing and the Commerce faculty wing (Figure 27).

The Law Building is roughly square in plan, and three stories in height, in addition to its basement. It is planned with the three-storey volume of the Law Library in the middle of the ground floor (Figure 28). This forms a central core, around which all of the other program elements – book stacks, classrooms, seminar rooms and offices are arranged. Holliday-Scott looked to the Parliamentary Library in Ottawa as a precedent for the interior of the Law Library, not for its shape or detail, but for the feeling that the space elicits (Figure 29). Holliday-Scott felt that in the case of the Law Building it was inappropriate to conceal the stacks as in some libraries. The Parliamentary Library served as an example of a, “building in the round...that has a mass that builds to the center,” (Holliday Scott, personal communication, September 5, 2013). The arrangement of stacks around a central space is clearly legible in the design of both the Parliamentary Library and the Law Library.

The device of using a large central space as the heart of a building was a hallmark of the work of John Holliday-Scott. In his own words, Holliday-Scott “…always liked doing buildings that work from the middle out…” (Holliday-Scott, J. Personal Communication, September 5, 2013). Otto Lang, the Dean of Law during the design and construction of the Law Building, described the library as, “the centre and heart of the structure around which everything else is built.” Holliday-Scott later designed a similar space in the Dental Clinic building, also on the University of Saskatchewan campus.
The Law Library is arranged over two floors, including all of the ground floor and parts of the first floor. Provisions for additional book storage space were made in a basement level, initially left unfinished but completed in 1980. The reading room is at the centre of the ground floor library space, ringed by book stacks and library support functions arranged around the perimeter. It is a soaring light-filled space, stretching more than three storeys in height and crowned by a cupola with clerestory glazing (Figures 26 & 28). On the first and second floors, corridors encircle the space and overlook the reading room. A smaller faculty reading room and a faculty lounge project out into the space on the second floor (Figure 30). Contained within the volume of the reading room, a separate structure of book stacks spans between the basement and first floors and is connected back to the first floor by two short bridges. In this structure, four floors of bookshelves are compressed into the vertical dimension of the three adjacent floors, and the structure has its own internal stair (Figure 31). The Law Library, in its materials and spatial form is a character-defining element.

The Commerce faculty wing is somewhat smaller than the Law Building, but is similarly square in plan. On each of its three floors, a large circular room is located in the centre of the plan, containing a faculty lounge on the second floor and seminar rooms on the ground and first floors (Figures 32 & 33). The central portion of the second floor is illuminated by clerestory glazing in a large square cupola (Figure 35). On all three floors, smaller offices and seminar rooms are arrayed around the perimeter.

The Commerce classroom wing is a three-storey linear form, connecting the Law Building and Commerce faculty wing. On each floor, a series of classrooms is arranged on the north side of a double-loaded corridor. Graduate student offices, washrooms and other support functions are arranged on the south side. A large reading room was also provided on the north side of the second floor, featuring a high ceiling, lined with wood and illuminated by a row of skylights. The reading room is a character-defining element (Figure 36).
Figure 32. The original ground floor plan of the Law & Commerce Complex. Retrieved from Facilities Management Division Asset Record System, File LC-55-P.

Figure 33. The original first floor plan of the Law & Commerce Complex. Retrieved from Facilities Management Division Asset Record System, File LC-199-C.
2.6 Systems

The Law and Commerce Buildings were constructed with a cast-in-place concrete structural frame and concrete floor slabs. Both buildings feature a ‘waffle’ slab floor system – a long span concrete slab system notable for the distinctive coffered pattern of its bottom surface, resembling a waffle. In many areas, such as the ceiling of the Law library and in the entrance lobby, the underside of the waffle slab is exposed for expressive effect. Exposed structural steel columns are also used in some instances, such as the entrance lobby and the reading room on the third floor of the Commerce classroom wing. The expression of structural elements such as concrete columns and waffle slabs is a character-defining element.

2.7 Use(s)

The Law and Commerce Buildings were built for the purposes of education in law and business administration, and still fulfill these functions. The construction of the two recent additions has shifted the distribution of uses in both buildings, particularly due to an increase in instructional space. However, the original uses and their accommodations remain essentially intact. The use of these buildings for education in law and commerce is a character-defining element.

Figure 34. The original second floor plan of the Edwards School of Business. Retrieved from Facilities Management Division Asset Record System, File LC-199-C.

Figure 35. Clerestory glazing in the Edwards School of Business.

Figure 36. The Commerce Reading Room.
The Law and Commerce buildings are associated with the history of the College of Law and the Edwards School of Business. The establishment of both a College of Law and of a Department of Commerce within the College of Arts & Science were early ambitions of Walter Murray, the first President of the university (Hayden, 1983 p. 126). The University of Saskatchewan appointed its first law professors, Arthur Moxon and Ira MacKay, in 1913. Later that year, the first classes were launched in a Bachelor of Laws program. In its early days, classes in the new College of Law were conducted from office buildings, in order to accommodate the schedules of those students articling in law firms downtown. Before the construction of its permanent home in the Law Building, the College of Law was housed in the MacKinnon Building, then Qu’Appelle Hall, and finally in the Murray Building. The Edwards School of Business was established in 1914 as the School of Accounting, and began admitting students to a Bachelor of Science program in Accounting in 1917. This was the first university-level program in accounting offered in Canada. In 1936, the school was named the College of Accounting, and became the College of Commerce in 1943. In 2007, the school was re-named after Canadian entrepreneur N. Murray Edwards as the Edwards School of Business.

The College of Law and the Law Building can be associated with Canada’s 13th Prime Minister, John G. Diefenbaker (Figure 37). Before becoming Prime Minister, Diefenbaker earned his Law Degree from the University of Saskatchewan. Diefenbaker was the first student at the University of Saskatchewan to receive three degrees, having previously earned both a Bachelor of Arts and a Master of Arts degree. Diefenbaker retuned to the university to speak at the Law Building’s opening.

The Law-Commerce complex can be associated with its designer, architect John Holliday-Scott of the firm Holliday-Scott & Associates Architects. Holliday Scott was born in the UK, and immigrated to Canada in 1957 after receiving his architectural degree from Kingston College of Art. He worked for a time with the firm Chamberlin, Powell and Bon and grew to respect their ability to incorporate architecture into context without being imitative. In Canada, Holliday-Scott first worked with the Saskatoon Firm Kerr and Cullingworth for two years before starting his own firm. Holliday-Scott’s first building for the University of Saskatchewan was the dining hall at Emma Lake, Kenderdine Campus. He was also the architect for the Dental Clinic and the Lutheran Seminary.

The Law Building can be associated with the Native Law Centre, which was founded in 1975 by Dr. Roger C. Carter. The Centre was created to facilitate access to legal education for Aboriginal peoples, to promote the interests of Aboriginal peoples within the legal system, and to disseminate information concerning Aboriginal
peoples and the law. The Centre became a department of the College of Law in 1984 and was established in purpose-built space as part of an addition to the Law Building completed in 2007.

3.-associated-objects

Around the Law Library are a series of paintings of notable graduates and former faculty of the College of Law. These include paintings of John G. Diefenbaker, Sir Frederick Haultain (First Premier of the North-West territories) and a portrait of Arthur Moxon by Augustus Kenderdine. (Figures 37 through 39).

In addition, photos of graduating Law and Commerce classes are distributed throughout the building. The 1919 graduating class photo features a young John G. Diefenbaker. The paintings and the graduate photos are associated objects of heritage value.

A bust of Emmett Hall, alumnus, chancellor and justice of the Supreme Court of Canada is located in the Law Library. Hall was present at the laying of the cornerstone of the MacKinnon building by Sir Wilfrid Laurier and would later attend Law School at the University of Saskatchewan alongside John G. Diefenbaker. Hall later became known as a father of medicare alongside former premier T.C. Douglas. One of Hall’s major contributions, as chair of a royal commission, was to propose a publicly financed national health plan that included a wide range of health services in addition to medical and hospital care.

The Law Library holds the holographic will of Cecil George Harris. The holographic or hand written will was etched on a tractor fender by Harris who became trapped under the equipment outside of Rosetown on June 8, 1948. The etching, done by pocket knife, reads, “In case I die in this mess, I leave all to the wife. Cecil Geo Harris.” After Harris died from his injuries it was determined by the courts to be a valid holographic will. The fender on which the will is inscribed, and Harris’ pocket knife were donated to the College of Law for public display in 1996 by the Kerrobert Courthouse (Figure 40).

Holliday-Scott designed a jury box and witness stand to accompany the Moot Court classroom. These furnishings and their materials are original to the building (Figure 42).
4. Supporting Documents


Facilities Management Division (2011). Asset Resource Database [Data File]. Retrieved from \usask\fmddfs\files\iis\IIS_Public\ARS


Holliday-Scott, J. Personal Communication. September 5, 2013


University of Saskatchewan Archives. College of Law, RG 2082, 006 College of Law Building, 1961-1967.

5. Summary of Character - Defining Elements

Materials
- greystone and Tyndall stone wall cladding
- aluminum-framed glazing
- wood: oak & birch
- welsh quarry tile flooring
- steel structures and staircases
- terrazzo flooring
- marble wall tile
- painted and plastic sprayed concrete walls & ceilings
- aluminum trim
- glazed ceramic wall tile

Form & Style
- irregular massing
- three distinct components: Law Building, Commerce classroom wing, Commerce faculty wing
- slot windows
- references to battlements
- precast concrete spires
- glazed connectors & entry
- exposed structural elements: waffle slabs, exposed columns
- material continuity
- rusticated greystone wall
- tripartite form of law building
- stair in entrance lobby

Location
Building
- orientation in relation to Arts Building
- facing Campus Drive & river

Spatial Configuration
- Law Library
- double loaded corridor in Commerce classroom wing
- glazed connectors & entry

Systems
- concrete structure with waffle floor slabs

Uses
- education in law and business
- library
- moot court
- reading room

Cultural & Chronological Associations
- history of College of Law and Edwards School of Business
- John G. Diefenbaker
- Architect John Holliday-Scott